

*******DRAFT MINUTES*******

Alexandria Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District

Wednesday, March 21, 2012

7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Tom Hulfish, Chairman
Chip Carlin
Oscar Fitzgerald
Art Keleher
Wayne Neale
John von Senden
Peter Smeallie

Staff Present: Planning & Zoning
Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager
Michele Oaks, Historic Preservation Planner

The meeting was called to order at 7:34 p.m. by Chairman Hulfish.

I. MINUTES

1. Consideration of the minutes of the public hearing of March 7, 2012.
BOARD ACTION: Approved, as submitted, 7-0.

On a motion by Mr. von Senden, seconded by Dr. Fitzgerald, the minutes were approved, as submitted, 7-0.

II. CONSENT ITEMS

Items on the Consent Calendar are those where the applicant has agreed to all conditions of approval shown in the staff reports. Without objection, the staff recommendation for these cases will be approved as a group by unanimous consent of the Board at the beginning of the meeting. When announced by the Chairman, any member of the Board or of the public may ask that one of these cases be removed for full discussion.

1. **CASE BAR2012-0043**

Request for alterations and signage at **702-704 King St**, zoned KR King Street Retail
APPLICANT: Nando's of Alexandria, LLC by M. Catharine Puskar

BOARD ACTION: The Board approved the application, as amended, on the Consent Calendar, 7-0.

III. DISCUSSION ITEMS

1. [CASE BAR2012-0032](#)

Request for demolition/encapsulation at **616 S Fairfax St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Mark & Kelley Robertson by Patrick Camus

BOARD ACTION: **The Board approved the application, as submitted, by a roll call vote, 7-0.**

See Item 2 for discussion.

2. [CASE BAR2012-0052](#)

Request for an addition at **616 S Fairfax St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Mark & Kelley Robertson by Patrick Camus

BOARD ACTION: **The Board approved the application, as submitted, by a roll call vote, 7-0.**

SPEAKERS

Patrick Camus, architect for the applicant, spoke on behalf of the application.

BOARD DISCUSSION

After determining the Board did not need to discuss the subject case, the Chairman called the question on the application, as submitted.

The Board approved the application, 7-0.

REASON

The Board found the proposed addition to be appropriately scaled and detailed and believed that it would enhance the existing mid-twentieth century Colonial Revival townhouse.

3. [CASE BAR2011-0055](#)

Request for partial demolition of Immanuel Chapel at **3737 Seminary Road (campus)/3591 Aspinwall Lane (Immanuel Chapel)**, zoned R20 Residential.

APPLICANT: The Protestant Episcopal Theological Seminary in Virginia

BOARD ACTION: **The Board approved the application, as amended, by a roll call vote, 6-1.**

CONDITIONS:

1. Approval of the Permit to Demolish for partial demolition of the chapel; and
2. The Board finds that the proposed new chapel will not adversely affect the remaining 100 Year Old Buildings located at Virginia Theological Seminary.
3. The previous requirements for documentation and archaeology in the May 4, 2011 approval are hereby incorporated in this recommendation.

SPEAKERS

Dunkin Blair, attorney for the applicant, spoke on behalf of the application.

Mary Kay Lanzillotta, architect for the project, summarized the scope of the project and discussed the specifications for the parging on the coping. She also noted that the heights of the walls might vary slightly from what were shown on the drawings but that notes have been added to the drawings that this would only be done in consultation with City Staff. Staff clarified for the Board that changes of more than 5% of the wall heights would return to the Board for review.

John Hynan, representing the Historic Alexandria Foundation, testified that Alexandria has a tradition of preservation and restoring and that the Immanuel Chapel was a “must” in their view, noting that the chapel is one of the most significant buildings in Alexandria. He further explained that the Foundation expects Alexandria to follow the examples of our forefathers and Winston Churchill, noting that when significant buildings (such as the White House and Parliament) were damaged by fire, they were rebuilt and the BAR should require that one of Alexandria’s most historic buildings also be restored.

Bill Dickenson, owner at 805 North Quaker Lane, noted that his previous testimony supported retaining a portion of the original chapel. He conveyed that he is pleased with the current proposal, as he believes it honors the space.

Gant Redmon, owner at 3800 Seminary Road, expressed his support for the project.

Jane Hipp, owner at 809 North Quaker Lane, expressed her support for the project.

Dick Hobson, 99 North Quaker Lane, noted that he was a long-time member of the church and conveyed his support of the project. He also noted that the Church’s vestry has also endorsed the project and has sent a letter of support to the BAR.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Smeallie summarized the BAR’s involvement in the project. He explained the Chairman had appointed two Board members (Mr. Smeallie and Mr. von Senden) to assist in resolving the issues expressed by the BAR. He noted that the BAR’s charge was to preserve as much of the structure viewed from the ROW as possible and to maintain the Gothic Revival architectural character of the structure.

Mr. von Senden added that an additional goal of the project was preservation of architectural fabric. He also explained that the earthquake in August further damaged portions of the structure that were unrelated to the fire.

Dr. Fitzgerald expressed his dissatisfaction with the current proposal, stating that in his mind, the building was not destroyed and if properly maintained after the fire it could have been reconstructed. He also stated that he felt that this project was demolition by choice and noted that he would not be supporting the application.

Mr. Keleher said that originally he was in favor of recreating the chapel and he was disappointed that protective measures such as a tarp were not installed on the building right after the fire. However, he also expressed his support for the current program for the chapel.

Mr. Neale concurred with Mr. Keleher's testimony, noting that he also wanted to have the building restored or adaptively reused, but supported the current proposal. He stated that he felt that an owner should have the ability to use their property as they see fit.

Mr. Carlin added that the revision was an appropriate adaptive reuse and a balanced solution and supported the application as submitted.

On a motion by Mr. Smeallie, seconded by Mr. von Senden, the Board approved the permit to demolish application, as amended, 6-1 (with Dr. Fitzgerald voting in opposition), and found that the proposed new chapel would have no adverse impact on the nearby 100 Year Old Buildings at the Seminary.

REASON

The Board found the proposed selective demolition to be a compromise that balanced the Seminary's concerns and objectives with the Board's charge to maintain the buildings of historic and architectural merit.

V. OTHER BUSINESS

- Presentation to the Board by The Window Man on fiberglass windows

VI. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

The following items are shown for information only. Based on the Board's adopted policies, these have been approved by Staff since the previous Board meeting.

CASE BAR2012-0054

Request for roof replacement at **102 Pommander Walk**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: John Scales

CASE BAR2012-0055

Request for fence installation at **420/422 N West St**, zoned RB Residential

APPLICANT: Jason Gordon

CASE BAR2012-0057

Request for in-kind roof replacement at **310 S Saint Asaph St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Disaster Response

CASE BAR2012-0058

Request for siding replacement at **1107 Powhatan St**, zoned RB Residential

APPLICANT: Judson Lantz

CASE BAR2012-0059

Request for siding replacement at **1105 Powhatan St**, zoned RB Residential

APPLICANT: Luke Roloff

CASE BAR2012-0060

Request for side yard fence at **708 Ford's Landing Way**, zoned W-1 Waterfront Mixed Use

APPLICANT: Edward Steele

CASE BAR2012-0063

Request for shed at **829 Queen St**, zoned RB Residential

APPLICANT: Kyong Yi

CASE BAR2012-0064

Request for garage vents at **608 Tivoli Passage Way**, zoned CRMU/X Commercial Residential Mixed Use (Old Town North)

APPLICANT: Hann & Hann Inc. c/o Todd Eltaher

CASE BAR2012-0065

Request for signage at **110 S West St**, zoned CD Commercial

APPLICANT: Fashion Finch by Amer Samman

CASE BAR2012-0068

Request for signage at **687 S Washington St**, zoned CD Commercial

APPLICANT: 4Everly After by FastSigns

CASE BAR2012-0069

Request for garage vents at **608 Tivoli Passage**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Disaster Response

VII. ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Hulfish adjourned the meeting at approximately 8:35pm.

Minutes submitted by,

Michele Oaks, Historic Preservation Planner
Boards of Architectural Review